
Confirming submission to Heliyon

Heliyon <em@editorialmanager.com>

Fri, Mar 19, 2021 at 10:03 PM

Reply-To: Heliyon <info@heliyon.com>

To: Heri Septya Kusuma <heriseptyakusuma@gmail.com>

This is an automated message.

Analysis of Bentonite Performance on the Quality of Refined Crude Palm Oil's Color, Free Fatty Acid and Carotene:
The Effect of Bentonite Concentration and Contact Time

Dear Dr. Kusuma,

We have received the above referenced manuscript you submitted to the Engineering section of Heliyon. It has been assigned the manuscript number HELIYON-D-21-02108. To track the status of your manuscript, please log in as an author at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/heliyon/>, and navigate to the "Submissions Being Processed" folder.

Thank you for submitting your work to Heliyon, an open access journal that is part of the Cell Press family.

Kind regards,
Heliyon

More information and support

You will find information relevant for you as an author on Elsevier's Author Hub: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors>

FAQ: How can I reset a forgotten password?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28452/supporthub/publishing/

For further assistance, please visit our customer service site: <https://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing/>

Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions, and learn more about Editorial Manager via interactive tutorials. You can also talk 24/7 to our customer support team by phone and 24/7 by live chat and email

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/heliyon/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Decision on submission HELIYON-D-21-02108 to Heliyon

Heliyon <em@editorialmanager.com>

Sun, Apr 4, 2021 at 11:02 PM

Reply-To: Heliyon <info@heliyon.com>

To: Heri Septya Kusuma <heriseptyakusuma@gmail.com>

Manuscript. Number.: HELIYON-D-21-02108

Title: Analysis of Bentonite Performance on the Quality of Refined Crude Palm Oil's Color, Free Fatty Acid and Carotene: The Effect of Bentonite Concentration and Contact Time

Journal: Heliyon

Dear Dr. Kusuma,

We have now received all of the reviewers' comments on your recent submission to Heliyon.

The reviewers have advised that your manuscript should become suitable for publication in our journal after appropriate revisions.

If you are able to address the reviewers' comments, which you can find below, I would like to invite you to revise and resubmit your manuscript. We ask that you respond to each reviewer comment by either outlining how the criticism was addressed in the revised manuscript or by providing a rebuttal to the criticism. This should be carried out in a point-by-point fashion as illustrated here: <https://www.cell.com/heliyon/guide-for-authors#Revisions>

To allow the editors and reviewers to easily assess your revised manuscript, we also ask that you upload a version of your manuscript highlighting any revisions made. You may wish to use Microsoft Word's Track Changes tool or, for LaTeX files, the latexdiff Perl script (<https://ctan.org/pkg/latexdiff>).

To submit your revised manuscript, please log in as an author at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/heliyon/>, and navigate to the "Submissions Needing Revision" folder under the Author Main Menu. Your revision due date is May 04, 2021.

We understand that the COVID-19 pandemic may well be causing disruption for you and your colleagues. If that is the case for you and it has an impact on your ability to make revisions to address the concerns that came up in the review process, please reach out to us.

I look forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Kind regards,

Bart Van der Bruggen
Associate Editor - Engineering
Heliyon

Editor and Reviewer comments:

Reviewer #1: Methods:the research materials and research procedures are related to this study. the research procedures are well explained in terms of data collection and data analysis. the methods also include the relevant reference from previously published method.

Results:the results are presented clearly in table and easily to understand.

Interpretation:the results are properly discussed, section by section according to the aims of study. Several typing errors such as thebleaching and β -karoten are identified.

In discussion part for the effect of bentonite concentration on CPO's carotene, the line '... the total of carotene as BE concentrations was added at 90 °C, 105 °C and 115 °C ' seems like focusing on the effect of different temperature. In discussion part for the effect of bentonite concentration on FFA levels, the line '(0 %) from oil' does not seem correct as if incomplete line.

Other comments: the overall content of the manuscripts are well reflecting the title.

Reviewer #2: Methods:

The methodology is well described and accurate with appropriate references. The procedure for the experiment is relatively easy to follow.

Results:

Graphical representation with normalized value would provide more correlations. What is the adsorption capacity and the removal efficiency?

Interpretation:

Clarification and explanation on the results can be extended. More results could be shown by comparing with the own experiment using BE or the practice in the industry.

Other comments:

The conclusion is too short. This section can be extended. The post treatment can be mentioned since the adsorbent powder is used in the process.

Article Format Check:

1. Equation Formulas are with small fonts. May consider larger size.
2. In Line 5 on page 5, equation 2 should change to Equation 2 to be consistent throughout the article. Since other locations, use "Equation" following by number.
3. In Line 6 on page 5, it requires one space between listing terms in equation and the new paragraph. Please check in other pages as well.
4. In Line 13 on page 5, to be consistent as written for Equation 1, unit should be included.
5. In Line 16 on page 5, to be consistent as written for Equation 1, unit should be included.
6. Typically, Table Caption does not start with "The".

Grammar and Spelling Check:

The grammar and spelling used in this paper needs to be rechecked.

Page 2 Line 56 Require space between two words: causedamage to cause damage

Page 6 Line 24 categories

Page 6 Line 47 Require space between two words: measurement)correlates to measurement) correlates

Page 8 Line 25 Require space between two words: thebleaching to the bleaching

Page 9 Line 13 β -carotene or β -karoten (as in Line 14)

Page 10 Line 60 Require space between two words: theirreactive to their reactive

Page 11 Line 24 Require space between two words: significanteffect to significant effect

Data in Brief (optional):

We invite you to convert your supplementary data (or a part of it) into an additional journal publication in Data in Brief, a multi-disciplinary open access journal. Data in Brief articles are a fantastic way to describe supplementary data and associated metadata, or full raw datasets deposited in an external repository, which are otherwise unnoticed. A Data in Brief article (which will be reviewed, formatted, indexed, and given a DOI) will make your data easier to find, reproduce, and cite.

You can submit to Data in Brief when you upload your revised manuscript. To do so, complete the template and follow the co-submission instructions found here: www.elsevier.com/dib-template. If your manuscript is accepted, your Data in Brief submission will automatically be transferred to Data in Brief for editorial review and publication.

Please note: an open access Article Publication Charge (APC) is payable by the author or research funder to cover the costs associated with publication in Data in Brief and ensure your data article is immediately and permanently free to access by all. For the current APC see: www.elsevier.com/journals/data-in-brief/2352-3409/open-access-journal

Please contact the Data in Brief editorial office at dib-me@elsevier.com or visit the Data in Brief homepage (www.journals.elsevier.com/data-in-brief/) if you have questions or need further information.

More information and support

FAQ: How do I revise my submission in Editorial Manager?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28463/supporthub/publishing/

You will find information relevant for you as an author on Elsevier's Author Hub: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors>

FAQ: How can I reset a forgotten password?

https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28452/supporthub/publishing/

For further assistance, please visit our customer service site: <https://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing/>

Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions, and learn more about Editorial Manager via interactive tutorials. You can also talk 24/7 to our customer support team by phone and 24/7 by live chat and email

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/heliyon/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Reviewer comments:

Reviewer #1:

1. In discussion part for the effect of bentonite concentration on CPO's carotene, the line '... the total of carotene as BE concentrations was added at 90 °C, 105 °C and 115 °C ' seems like focusing on the effect of different temperature.
2. In discussion part for the effect of bentonite concentration on FFA levels, the line '(0 %) from oil' does not seem correct as if incomplete line.

Reviewer #2:

1. What is the adsorption capacity and the removal efficiency?
2. Clarification and explanation on the results can be extended. More results could be shown by comparing with the own experiment using BE or the practice in the industry.
3. The conclusion is too short. This section can be extended. The post treatment can be mentioned since the adsorbent powder is used in the process.

Authors reply to Reviewer's comments: Response to Reviewer #1:

We are grateful for constructive comments from reviewers. We appreciate it very much for making our manuscript quality better. We have completely revised the manuscript and answered every reviewers' comment carefully. We hope that the revised version is suitable for publication in this journal.

Comment 1: In discussion part for the effect of bentonite concentration on CPO's carotene, the line '... the total of carotene as BE concentrations was added at 90 °C, 105 °C and 115 °C' seems like focusing on the effect of different temperature.

Response: We have replaced this sentence with a sentence that focuses on discussing the effect of bentonite concentration on carotene. "This result accords with Silva et al. (2013), which suggested that there was a decrease in the total of carotene as BE concentrations were added. However, the percentage of carotene values reduction in this study was lower than (Silva et al. (2013) which was 89% (Silva et al., 2013), and Silva et al. (2014), which was 95.5% (from 467 to 21 mg/kg) (Silva et al., 2014)."

Comment 2: In discussion part for the effect of bentonite concentration on FFA levels, the line' (0%) from oil' does not seem correct as if incomplete line.

Response: We have corrected this sentence that while alkaline eggshell powder can remove all levels of FFA from oil

Response to Reviewer # 2:

We are grateful to reviewers who have taken their valuable time to provide suggestions to improve this manuscript. We have answered all of the questions with the utmost care. We hope that the revised version is suitable for publication in this journal.

Comment 1: What is the adsorption capacity and the removal efficiency?

Response: We have added data and discussed the adsorption capacity and removal efficiency for carotene and FFA using bentonite. The best adsorption capacity for the effect of bentonite concentration on the carotene value of 13.60 mg/g while FFA levels of 6.67E-06 L/g. The best adsorption capacity for the effect of contact time on carotene values was 61.32% at 60 minutes, while FFA levels were 2.33%. The adsorption capacity and removal efficiency, color, carotene value, and FFA content depend on the concentration of bentonite used and contact time.

Comment 2: Clarification and explanation on the results can be extended. More results could be shown by comparing with the own experiment using BE or the practice in the industry.

Response: We have added more discussion about comparing the results obtained in this study and previous studies' results. We have compared the trends in adsorption capacity and removal efficiency in this study with the results obtained in previous studies.

Comment 3: The conclusion is too short. This section can be extended. The post treatment can be mentioned since the adsorbent powder is used in the process

Response: we have extended the conclusion by adding information about adsorption capacity and removal efficiency regarding the effect of contact time and bentonite concentration on carotene and FFA levels. In this conclusion, we have also provided a summary of research procedures that can show the ease of applying this research in both the community and the industrial world. So that we can also use it to show

that the results of this study are applicable and can be applied on a small to large scale (home industry/SME to industry).

Decision on submission to Heliyon

Heliyon <em@editorialmanager.com>
Reply-To: Heliyon <info@heliyon.com>
To: Heri Septya Kusuma <heriseptyakusuma@gmail.com>

Wed, Jun 2, 2021 at 8:56 PM

Manuscript Number: HELIYON-D-21-02108R1

Title: Analysis of Bentonite Performance on the Quality of Refined Crude Palm Oil's Color, Free Fatty Acid and Carotene: The Effect of Bentonite Concentration and Contact Time

Journal: Heliyon

Dear Dr. Kusuma,

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to Heliyon.

I am pleased to inform you that your manuscript has been accepted for publication.

Your accepted manuscript will now be transferred to our production department. We will create a proof which you will be asked to check, and you will also be asked to complete a number of online forms required for publication. If we need additional information from you during the production process, we will contact you directly.

We appreciate and value your contribution to Heliyon. We regularly invite authors of recently published manuscript to participate in the peer review process. If you were not already part of the journal's reviewer pool, you have now been added to it. We look forward to your continued participation in our journal, and we hope you will consider us again for future submissions.

Kind regards,
James Morgan
Editorial Assistant
Heliyon

Embargo

Embargos are not automatically set for papers published in Heliyon. Papers appear online a few days after acceptance. To request a media embargo and/or publication on a specific date to assist an institutional press release, please reach out to the Heliyon team (info@heliyon.com) as soon as possible and we will do our best to accommodate your request.

Editor and Reviewer comments:

The revised version could be accepted in the present form.
Section Editor
M.M. Rashidi

More information and support

FAQ: When and how will I receive the proofs of my article?
https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/6007/p/10592/supporthub/publishing/related/

You will find information relevant for you as an author on Elsevier's Author Hub: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors>

FAQ: How can I reset a forgotten password?
https://service.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/a_id/28452/supporthub/publishing/
For further assistance, please visit our customer service site: <https://service.elsevier.com/app/home/supporthub/publishing/>

Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions, and learn more about Editorial Manager via interactive tutorials. You can also talk 24/7 to our customer support team by phone and 24/7 by live chat and email

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/heliyon/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.